
Received: 9 February 2020; Revised: 9 April 2020; Accepted: 12 June 2020

Original Article

Holistic Orientation in Education: Transformative Art of Including, Connecting and Balancing

Gaurav Ojha

Sunway International Business School
Maiti Devi Marg, Kathmandu, Nepal

Email: ojhagaurav84@gmail.com

 0000-0001-8439-1915

Abstract

This study explores holistic orientation in education reflecting on practice-based accounts of educators with emerging pedagogical insights and implication conceptualized within transformative learning theory. Similarly, this study explores holistic orientation in education with a reflective praxis that advances collaborative self-narrative research incorporating personal reflections of educators seeking to nurture transformed ways of including, connecting and balancing in their pedagogical practices. In this study, educators with holistic orientations place emphasis on inner lives, balance, exploring dynamics of interconnections, trustful and authentic relationships, dialogues, concern and care as transformative initiatives in their pedagogical practices. Based on the guiding metaphor that what you see depends upon how you look, this article offers both descriptive and reflective insights into pedagogical reflections of educators that exemplify holistic orientations as a practical implication for transformative learning. The findings of this article indicate holistic orientations in education as a resonance educators experience and explore between why they teach and how they teach. More importantly, together with further implications for transformative research and education policy, this study aims to recreate possibilities for transforming educational practices with transformed ways of being, balancing, and relating of educators.

Keywords: *Holistic learning. Transformative learning. Pedagogical insights. Collaborative research.*

Holistic Orientations in Education: Exploring Unrealized Implication

When I reflect on my educational journey, I realize that the possibility of education remains more than mere transmission of knowledge or a transaction of knowledge between students

and teacher. Rather the purpose of education also needs to identify its transformative orientations, reflections and interconnections. As Lawrence and Cranton (2009) suggest, in their study on transformative learning, as a researcher I begin my search for holistic orientation in education resonating with their expression: what you see depends upon how you look. I have assimilated this expression as a guiding metaphor for this article, to reflect upon holistic orientations in transformative learning from the pedagogical expressions of educators in Kathmandu Valley.

As I observe in the context of institutional schools within Kathmandu Valley, non-traditional approaches, such as transformative learning and alternative pedagogy, have been gradually embraced as an example of progress, improvement or a shift in educational paradigm. Therefore, terms like holistic education, transformative learning, creativity and alternative pedagogies have found their significance within our institutional school system, their workshops, teacher training programs and seminars. Transformative learning, conversely, is not merely a concept or a theory, rather it implies to an existential process of being and becoming that requires different orientation towards teaching and learning activities altogether.

Moreover, as Palmer et al. (2010) remind us, we can transform our education system, not with another theory, a formula or with some sophisticated approach, but with educators prepared for a transformed way of being in the world. Similarly, from the perspective of transformative learning, a change of perspective in educational practices comprises transformative understanding of teaching self (Taylor, 2017). Hence, beyond theory, concept or a mere jargon, this study explores holistic orientation in education with educators seeking to sustain, nurture and recognize transformed ways of being in their educational practices.

Similarly, as a participant in different seminars, conferences, workshop and educational discussions, I have usually encountered expressions like transformative learning and holistic education in abundance. However, as Taylor and Cranton (2013) indicate, transformative learning theory no longer transforms itself, discussions, deliberations and presentations on different concepts and key expressions of transformative learning are not enough. Hence, transformative research needs to recognize and exemplify courage, entailing commitments and inner convictions of educators prepared to negotiate and act upon their purposes, values, feelings and meanings regarding their pedagogical practices rather than uncritically assimilated educational practices that they have assimilated from others (Mezirow, 2003). Therefore, by choosing collaborative inquiry as research methodology, this article consults primary sources for exploring how an educator envisions to transform lives with their pedagogical practices (Wagley & Luitel, 2017) and how these practices can be exemplified in a collaborative self-reflective journey with educators, as expressions and examples of holistic orientations with practical implication for transformative learning theory (Taylor, 2017)

More importantly, previous literature published within Nepalese context (Pasa, 2019; Pandey, 2019; Qutoshi, 2018) indicate a substantial research gap regarding research praxis related with transformative research paradigm. Previous studies have used auto-ethnographic research for exploring transformative experiences of educators in an educational journey, and this method has been used by only those researchers both theoretically oriented and methodologically competent to reflect upon their educational journey from the perspectives of transformative learning and self-reflective praxis. Similarly, auto-ethnography has been considered by scholars and researchers within education studies as a dominant method for transformative education and research (Qutoshi, 2015; Belbase et al., 2008). Beyond reflections of lone auto-ethnographers, this study is a collaborative research journey of researcher and the research participants to co-construct self-reflective narratives that enables participations to reflect on their pedagogical practices as holistic orientations in education.

Moreover, this study aims to create possibilities for collective auto-ethnography research that ensemble both personal and collective, besides solo-performances of auto-ethnographic study (Hernandez et al., 2017). Hence, this paper flashes out yet another direction for transformative research as a collaborative musical improvisation as an ensemble between researcher and participants.

Based on these observations and research gaps, in this article collaborative research method has been used to reflective on pedagogical practices of educators to explore and substantiate holistic orientations in transformative learning. Within transformative learning theory, Taylor (2017) recognizes holistic approach as an important construct that shapes the transformative experiences in education and recognizing holistic orientations has both research and practical implication for transformative learning. Therefore, the main purpose of this article is to enrich and stimulate our understanding of holistic approaches in education that recognizes the role of feelings, dialogues, inclusion and balance of perspective, other ways of knowing and teaching and trustful relationships in transformative learning process (Taylor, 2017).

The article discusses collaborative research that incorporates personal reflections of secondary and higher secondary educators associated with different institutional schools in Kathmandu Valley seeking to nurture ways of including, connecting and balancing in their educational practices. More importantly, this article aims to initiate transformative self-reflection that culminates into transformation of perspectives among educators and readers. This study encourages them to reflect their inner lives, balance, interconnections, alternative ways of knowing and teaching, inclusions, trustful relationships, feeling, dialogues, concern and care in their pedagogical practices. After all, as Hart (2014) argues, holistic orientation in education begins when educators take notice of their own inner lives and then find ways to invite students to do the same with pedagogical practices that recognize the role of relationships with others as an integral part of transformative learning process.

Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

This research builds on holistic orientation as an emerging construct with practical implication for transformative learning theory (Mezirow & Taylor, 2006; Taylor, 2017) that acknowledges role of feelings, awareness, different ways of learning and knowing, and dialogues among educators and their students in a reflective journey sustained by transformative relationship. After all, the role of relationships among educators and students in transformative learning has been increasingly acknowledged as transformative pedagogical practice (Taylor & Snyder, 2012). Hence, based on transformative learning theory, this study explores affective dimension of educators, their inner feelings, awareness, convictions, and commitments together with the relational aspects of their pedagogical practices in a research journey that reflects upon holistic orientations in education. For relational dimension, this study also argues that students still need a positive relationship with their educators, particularly when it comes to motivation and providing feedback (Dawson et al., 2018).

Similarly, this study recognizes core elements of transformative learning theory such as individual experience, critical reflection, dialogue, context, and authentic relationships (Taylor, 2009), as integral dimensions of holistic orientations in education. In this study, transformative learning theory has been used as a theoretical framework to explain pedagogical practices of educators as a part of learning process for constructing and appropriating new and revised interpretations of the meaning of an experience in different educational context (Taylor & Cranton, 2012).

Biesta (2007) argues that holistic, democratic or transformative orientation in education is not just about the transmission of knowledge, skills, and values, but is concerned

with the individuality or subjectivity the student, and their uniqueness as singular beings. Similarly, Harder, Robertson, and Maiden (2019) in their article on building holistic framework for transformational learning argue that holistic approach explicitly focuses on the four aspects of being, such as body, mind, heart, and soul, and the learning within this model follows four modalities: lecture-discussion, physical-recreational, experiential-relational, and reflective-meditative.

Within holistic orientation in education, transformative learning process focuses on different aspects of being and different modalities of teaching and learning process that enriches different dimensions of being students and educators share together. For example, lecture and discussion methods formulate mind or cognitive aspect of being whereas reflective or meditative aspect nurtures soul and heart. Therefore, from the perspective of holistic education, inter/connections at emotional, spiritual and relational spheres of being represent a foundation for transformative educational processes, where teacher and learner, teaching and learning are woven into a web of transformative relationship (Nakagawa 2000).

Moreover, Mezirow (1991), in an article exploring transformative dimensions in learning, suggests that meaning exists within ourselves, rather than in external forms such as books, and that the personal meanings that we acquire from our experiences are authenticated through human interaction and experience. Hence, based on ideas of transformative learning, this study also explores how as educators we reflect and interpret our lived pedagogical experiences.

Besides, Nodding's (2002) description of a relational self relates to holistic orientation in education as a responsive caring way of being that occurs when a self is understood as relational, encountering other selves, objects and events in the world, all of which infuse together in a meaning-making processes and this also considers caring relations as essential aspect of holistic orientation. And, this study recognizes relational dimension as integral part of holistic orientation in education. Moreover, as J. Miller (2007) argues, holistic orientation in education involves exploring and making connections, and it makes an attempt to move away from fragmentation to connectedness.

Taylor (2006) suggests that fostering transformative learning in the classroom depends on establishing meaningful and genuine relationship. Therefore, this study also explores relational dimensions in education as integral part of transformative experience. More importantly, this study also recognizes that genuine and trustful relationship between educator and student fosters holistic orientation in transformative learning. This study also reviews holistic orientation in transformative learning, from the perspective of relationships that enrich a sense of balance, inclusion and connection (J. Miller, 2007)

Similarly, Lederach (1996), in a study on transformative education theory for a holistic educational practice in school, indicates that the classroom would be based on understanding that sustains fair, respectful and inclusive process as a way of life, and envisions outcomes as a commitment to increase justice, seeking truth, and healing relationships. Furthermore, this study based on White and Nitkin (2014) argues that transformational learning is an outcome of transformational teaching, and for students to change their role, the role and responsibility of educators needs to change well. After all, without transformative teaching, transformative learning remains empty and unfulfilled.

Similarly, drawing from a work of Miller (2000), this study recognizes holistic orientation in education as humanistic and also spiritual critique of the dominant educational culture. Likewise, this study also describes inner integrity of educators as spiritual critique of dominant educational practices, and within this critique convictions and commitments for transformations also manifest. More importantly, this study acknowledges that educators with holistic orientations possess a capacity for interconnectedness and these educators are capable

of weaving a complex web of connections among themselves, their subjects, and their students (Palmer, 1999).

As article by Illeris (2014) suggests and this study also acknowledges, transformative learning needs to be defined by identity and the research on holistic orientations in transformative leaning needs to give examples on how the concepts of transformative learning and teaching identity of educator can mutually enrich each other. Hence, this study explores intersectional and enriching relationship between inner convictions of educators, their interconnections in the frame of holistic orientation and pedagogical practices that sustain transformative learning experiences between educator and their students. Similarly, as suggested by Nye and Clark (2016), acknowledging holistic orientations in education, this study also recognizes emergent collegial dialogues between educators and students within educational settings as transformative context that creates alternative and irregular opportunities where transformative learning can occur.

More importantly, considering Nepalese literature on transformative education research, Pasa (2019) as educator recounts his narratives of transformation from being then to being here, and journey from being a waiter to becoming a lecturer, as he considers himself as a potential organic intellectual as an outcome of his transformative educational journey. Similarly, Pandey (2019) also explores importance of transformative learning using auto-ethnographic study to document his lived educational experiences through stories in a self-reflective journey, understanding of his self, other selves, and cultures around him. Besides, Qutoshi (2018) in a study has created a space for self-study practitioners to think about how to engage with multi-epistemic approaches in order to experience transformative learning. Hence, building on existing literature on transformative research, this research focuses on collaborative research to reflect on transformative journey and experience of educators (un)aware of holistic/transformational orientations in conceptualization, yet resembling them in practice, in their art of doing, being and relating.

Research Design

This study is qualitative in its orientation and the search for holistic orientations in education emerges in a collaborative narrative research. Regarding research paradigm, this study orients towards post-positivist qualitative research, which gives opportunities for the researcher and the research participants to co-create knowledge (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). Based on collaborative narrative inquiry, this study engages in a process of creating new knowledge, reflections or realizations based on narrative experiences of educators in an educational context (Craig, 2001). In this study, the researcher aims to produce a reconstruction of participants' understandings and meaning they make out of their experiences (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). This research encompasses multivocality and inter-subjectivity in a dialogical process, which enables self-reflexivity into individual narratives and co-constructs meaning, brining self-narratives of educators together towards a common experience (Hernandez et al., 2017). In this study, multivocality represents dialogical encounters between researcher and the narrative voices of educators culminating into inter-subjective interactions; hence, story version of the events for the teacher in this study has been recreated into narratives of lived experiences (Craig, 2001).

In the research process, I have concentrated on single entity-holistic orientation in a particular context giving way to a rich descriptive end-product to illuminate the reader's understanding by bringing about the discovery of new meaning through narrative expressions (Merriam & Simpson, 2000). Moreover, in this research, narratives recollected, reconstructed and reflected by the researcher entail a collaborative approach as both the researcher and his participants search for the presence of holistically orientated and transformative lived

pedagogical experiences of educators. In search for holistic orientation, this study focuses on thematic analysis because this research design allows participants to describe their lived experiences and for the researcher to explore themes emerging with meaning units that resonates with holistic orientations in education. In this study the researcher has thematically assimilated reflections of educators emerged as data within three categories.

In this small-scale case study, all the research participants (N=8) have teaching experience of above ten years in high school education (grade 9-12, GCE A-Levels). They were briefed about the purpose of the study and they expressed their consent for the interview. Educators (N=8) recognized as research participants in this study include, mathematics educator (n=1), general paper educator (n=2) social studies educator (n=2), economics educator (n=1) and business studies educator (n=2). Similarly, the researcher had informal group discussions with students (N=10) of research participants to reflect on pedagogical practices of educators. Narrative expressions of students have been used to exemplify discussions in this study. Besides, it is important to mention that my research participants, prior to the timeframe with me, were unaware of the conceptual framework for holistic orientations in transformative learning. The researcher collected data for around the time period of six months through interviews, informal discussions, group discussion with students as a progressive research journey culminating into essential explorations.

Since thematic analysis can either be inductively or theoretically conducted (Braun & Clarke, 2006), to explore essentials of holistic education the researcher has used in this study principles of holistic education as formulated by Miller (2007), who argues that holistic orientation involves exploring and making connections, as an attempt to move away from fragmentation to connectedness. After content analysis, relevant expressions of educators have been combined and illustrated into three mutually inclusive themes for further exploration. Miller (2005) has described three basic principles of holistic education: connectedness, inclusion, and balance. Hence, based on principles of holistic education formulated by Miller, this study has explored holistic orientation in education as practiced by the research participants. Here, connectedness refers to fostering interconnections among different polarities such as self and subject, formal and non-formal learning orientations, classroom environment and outside world, relationship between educator and students. Likewise, inclusion refers to including students of differing socio-cultural backgrounds and varying levels of abilities into teaching and learning practices without labeling or discriminating them. Lastly, balance refers to finding harmony between being and becoming and also between inner-self and teaching-self of educators (Palmer, 2009)

Moreover, in this article, I have evaluated perceptions of educators regarding their pedagogical practices in an interactive interview process. The collected data was analyzed and regrouped into identified themes of balance. The process of analyzing responses consisted of identifying significant statements that conveyed participants' experiences, and such information categorized based on three main themes for analysis (Creswell, 2012). Meanwhile, narrating their subjective vignettes, participations in this study engaged in dialogue with the researcher recollect their lived pedagogical experiences, which were weaved together as thematic explorations. This research builds on conceptualization of transformative education research as flashed out by Luitel and Wagley (2017), which includes recreating meaning-making from collaborative interactions, with subjective truths in a given context together with research participant.

Findings: Realizing Together- Holistic Orientations in Transformative Learning

In this study, lived pedagogical experiences of educators have been described to gain insights regarding their convictions, commitments, contexts, struggles, awareness, dialogues and

sense of identity. Transformative learning, as Mezirow (2009) indicates, problematizes frames of reference within fixed assumptions and expectations within educational practices to make educational orientations more inclusive, non-discriminating, open, reflective, and holistic and make both students and educators emotionally able to change. Subsequently, in this study educators are prepared to critically reflect on various assumptions and beliefs about teaching and learning process and also make conscious effort within ourselves to understand and explore other dimensions of knowing, learning, being and relating.

In a collaborative research journey, the researcher and research participants have scrambled towards understanding of holistic orientations in education with reference to connectedness, inclusion, and balance (Miller, 2005). These three dimensions for thematic explorations are disruptive as they challenge uncritically assimilated perspectives of educators (Mezirow, 2000) away from their regular habits of educators positioning themselves as exclusive, different from learners, transactional, indifferent and distant in their pedagogical practices. And, as educators speak their lived experiences; this study illustrates their thoughts, feelings, emotions, struggles and reflections in a collaborative study that combines their experiences and my interpretations within theoretical/conceptual framework of transformative learning. In this study relevant expressions of educators have been interpreted under theme description of connecting, including, and balancing.

Connecting

As Belenky and Stanton (2000) describe, transformative learning is indeed a relational process. This is to say, holistic orientations in transformative learning seek for emotional interconnections and relational dimensions in education. Regarding connectedness, a participant indicates: *As educators we need to realize that nothing happens in isolation; personal growth, emotional wellness, creativity, moral development, social competency, physical well-being, and intellectual growth of educators and students are interconnected with overall education practices in a given context that guides society, culture and policies.*

Another participant rather lucidly expresses: *I share stories, anecdotes, vignettes, examples and inspirations with my students so that they realize how different human pursuits, achievements, events, concerns and behaviours are interrelated, and why and where they stand among scheme of things. I encourage my students to understand interconnections between ecology, economics, society, politics and their subject matter. Truly what they are learning matters and it can make a difference in their lives.*

When an educator explores interconnections between subject matter, interests of student and external realities, they recreate their teaching pedagogy as more explorative and engaging (Miller, 2007). Reflecting on interconnections, an educator reflects: *I see oral presentations, group discussions, debates and dialogues as an arena for interconnections between outside realities and classroom learning, between confusions and clarities, differences and similarities and, more importantly, between agreements and disagreements.* Hence, as exemplified, educators with holistic orientations engage into transformative learning by bringing and interconnecting outer realities of existence into classroom discussions, debates and dialogues to engage students for critical questioning and the deliberate presentation of points of view that are contradictory to yet complementary with each other (Cranton, 2006).

Balancing

Similarly, regarding balance, an educator indicates: *My profession as an educator is a bridge that creates balance between my being and becoming, and I acknowledge my students as*

pilgrims journeying together in a sacred vocation. Being a teacher is not my mask. I am an educator, and there is harmony between my inner life, relationships and outer aspirations. Hence, when a student calls me a teacher, I feel that voice resonating with my being; I am indeed an educator. I am a teacher; therefore, I teach. For me, why I teach finds congruence with how I teach. As Cranton (2006) argues, educators spend their days rushing from task to task and the question remains how often we as educators stop to think about who we are as educators. Are we seeking balance between our own being and becoming, before expecting it from our students? Therefore, it is necessary for educators to engage in self-reflective practices, which enable them to gain insights regarding inner voice as an educator.

After all, without balance between being and becoming of educators, critical self-reflections that sustains deep shift in perspectives and regular reactive habit of educators remains indeed as hollow and unfulfilled. Therefore, Palmer (2009) argues, educators can certainly teach effectively and efficiently using different techniques, but education and learning does not truly begin until the teacher is able to connect and find balance with his/her teaching self with their inner self.

Furthermore, regarding balance, an educator expresses: *Sharing my own personal stories lets them see a glimpse of who I am and not only as the teacher but as a human being who stands in front of the classroom. That's my way of balancing the scale of relationship with my students. I have my struggles and anxieties as a parent, husband, friend, community worker. I relate the stories from when I was a student just like them, to make them realize we teachers are too humans after all and we are on the same boat together.* In fact, when it comes to finding balance through sharing personal stories, Kroth and Cranton (2014) suggest that storytelling enables educators and learners to understand the process of transformative learning through first-hand accounts of others' transformative experiences.

Moreover, in the midst of accountability, assignments, evaluations and standardized tests, holistic orientation in education seeks for a balance among different imbalances that occur between teacher and student and content and process. Regarding search for balances among different imbalances, an educator indicates: *I remind my students to read and search about subject matter discussed in the classroom from different sources, apart from prescribed course books and reflect on their specialized subject together with socio-political and economic realities emerging outside the walls of classroom.* Similarly, from the perspective of transformative learning, an adult educator realizes that different learners engage in learning in different ways, or the same individual may engage in learning differently depending on the content and context of the process (Kroth & Cranton, 2014). Hence, an educator with holistic orientation needs to explore and find balance among different alternative pedagogical practices to sustain diverse learning possibilities.

Including

Regarding inclusive pedagogical practices, a research participant mentions: *I often sit together with my students in small circles during recesses as co-inquirer listening to their perspectives. I need to include them within my educational practices as much as possible. Many students in my classroom feel that they are deprived of love and I believe this is the root of violence, indifference, carelessness of our students. I see my students as friends.* Moreover, as Clark (2005) suggests, transformative learning cannot happen without friendships, perhaps because many people most often turn to their social relationships to work through their everyday life events and shifts in perspectives.

Similarly, another educator reports: *I seek to maintain inclusive values in educational settings and students, irrespective of their performance or lack to it, are to be respected as human beings first.* Besides, as Greene (1995) describes, seeing people as small creates space

for exclusion, where academic non-performers or underachievers are seen as small marginalized or irrelevant students, and as educators we look at them from a detached-distant perspective. However, from the perspective of holistic orientations, we see all learners as big as we see them in their full humanity and worth.

Moreover, as Cranton (2006) states, when an educator sets up an environment and learning context in which people critically question their habits of mind in order to become open to alternatives, it culminates into emancipatory learning. In this regard, an educator expresses: *I have included critical thinking and reflective writing beyond regular habits of merely giving instructions and lectures, in my pedagogical practice because it enables students to question their prejudices, half-truths and ignorance. We discuss and debate in an inclusive way, recognizing differences and divergence in thoughts and emotions.*

Furthermore, an educator reveals: *I engage in dialogues for exploring inclusive and interactive ways of knowing with my students. We as educators become exclusivist when we deny or postpone dialogues with students. The more I reflect, the more I realize that being a student and an educator is two sides of the same coin; both include one another.* Regarding inclusion through dialogues, Blalock and Akehi (2018) argue that the process of dialogue can be a way for people to connect around shared experiences that can further connect individuals around an inclusive commonality. Dialogues enable transformative learning by creating a context for learners to feel connected and also included within the educational process. More importantly, engaging in dialogues reflects pedagogy beyond exclusionary practices.

Similarly, qualitative narratives of educators collected, illustrated and reflected in this study are comparable with a study by Conti (2002) that indicates: (i) holistic orientation in education emphasizes the idea of connectedness, which is to say--*My identity and inspirations as a teacher are knotted with aspirations of my students;* (ii) educators use convictions of their inner life as source of their pedagogy practices -- *When I enter inside the classroom, the first thing I tell myself is that I can make difference in the lives of my students through my inner qualities of care, support, concern, empathy and patience.* (iii) educators view teaching as an inner calling -- *My profession as an educator is a bridge that balances between my beings and becoming;* (iv) educators believe that much of their success depends on their own authenticity as whole persons -- *I believe, teaching becomes transformative when I find that my students realize their passions and their enthusiasm resembles my inspirations for them.* Besides, as Christiaens, Abegglen, and Gardner (2010) mention, educators oriented towards holistic education focus on self-care, person care, touch, and lifelong learning. Likewise, research participants in the study are also exploring application of these concepts in their pedagogical practices.

Discussions

In this study, thematic explorations of narrative expressions within the theme of connecting reveal that search for authentic and trustful relationship between educators and learners establishes foundations for holistic orientations in transformative learning (Taylor, 2007). It is through building relationship educators engage with their learners at affective level. More importantly, authentic and trustful relationship allows individuals to have discussions openly and achieve greater level of mutual understanding. Taylor (2017) mentions that holistic orientations in transformative learning recognizes the role of feelings, other ways of knowing and the role of relationships with others. Similarly, in this study educators are including different ways of knowing in their pedagogical practices, finding balance between their inner aspirations and outer performances and including their students in dialogues and discussions irrespective of all the differences.

As Slavick and Zimbardo (2012) indicate, transformational teaching involves more than creating lesson plans for adult learners, as it needs to bridge dynamic relationships between the teachers and adult learners, creating a shared knowledge base, and enriches learning and growth. Hence, educators in this study, with their connections, balance and inclusive orientations seek to enrich their students in a dynamic, trustful, respectful and authentic relationship. In this regard, reflections of students also exemplify importance of authentic relationship in education: *our educator applies multiple classroom discussions and dialogues to solve complex issues arising within subject matter, and more importantly, our teacher as a guide encourages us to evaluate what we already know about the subject matter before telling us to learn those concepts we are unaware before the interaction. We feel the presence of educator as a matured friend or as a family member.*

Educators in this study are seeking for dialogue when helping individuals create and maintain a comfortable sense of self, during a time that may be uncomfortable for them (Cranton, 2006); and by engaging the affective dimensions of their students they are providing an opportunity, for establishing a dialogue that expresses through various images, feelings, and behaviors within the learning setting (Dirkx, 2006). Regarding affective dimension a student argues: *my perspective regarding education has transformed, as I realize that my educator understands and acknowledges me as human being with emotions, feeling and moods. While discussing with my educator, I feel a sense of comfort and inclusion because I can dialogue with him as we both speak and listen.*

Moreover, this study also emphasizes the importance of teachers bringing their own experiences into the classroom and linking them to the academic discussion. Besides, in a study, Kreber (2004) concluded that when teaching, teachers also need to be more concerned with why they teach than with how or what they teach. And, the findings of this study within the theme of balancing also suggest that holistic orientations in transformative learning emphasizes on educators to reflect, explore and find balance between why they teach in resonance with how they teach. Similarly, Kathleen, Lisa Harrison, and Hurd (2018) also indicate that transformative process in education requires educators to understand the deeper sense of inner self and world around them and a transformative educator needs to perform re-examination of their dispositions, practices, and ways of thinking and being.

As an implication, this study suggests that for reforming profession of teaching, even in the context of Nepal, education policymakers have overlooked the possibilities of teacher's sense of purpose in educational change and transformations (Hargreaves & Fullan, 1998). This study also claims that transforming education involves purpose, passion, inspirations, convictions and hopes of educators. Moreover, this study recommends, according to Palmer (2003), that educational institutions need to create settings where teachers feel comfortable to discuss and to reflect on questions related to meaningful living. Similarly, based on the findings exemplified within the theme of including, this study also suggests that for transformative change to occur, sustainable teaching and learning must move beyond traditional methods of education and become more inclusive in which individuality, intellectual rigor, rationality, diversity and different orientations and exploration regarding transfer of knowledge are privileged in the educational process (Burns, 2011).

As another implication, comparable with study by Yacek (2020), this study identifies that the term transformative education has become commonplace within the educational research community in Nepal, and it has great potentialities for transforming education. However, sustaining transformative education requires deep psychological restructuring on the part of both educators and students. More importantly, for transformative research praxis, this research implicates further research on how educators challenge and question their beliefs as educators to recreate structural changes in their educational orientations (Mezirow & Taylor, 2006). Transformative praxis research needs to explore genuine desire of educators

to negotiate new frames of reference in a collaborative research for creating transformative possibilities in education.

Conclusion

This study, reflecting on practice-based accounts of educators, reveals that holistic orientation in education seeks for a caring, open, non-authoritarian relationship between people, which leads to genuine learning through various expressions of personal convictions and pedagogical practices. Specifically, establishing relationships between teacher and student is an essential dimension of transformative learning (Taylor, 2017). The transformative relationship between student and teacher allows both having discussions and dialogues, share information openly and achieve mutual and consensual understanding. Besides, the findings and discussions illustrated in this study support the notion that the art of including, connecting and balancing can be transformative experience for both students and their educators.

This study also suggests that the role of an educator is to enable students to explore their own essence by exposing them to various paths and possibilities they may take in life. Hence, educators need to understand their personal lives and the meaning they have constructed from their personal experiences (Owings, Kaplan & Chappell, 2011). Besides, this study encourages educators, in relation to their education practice, to recreate transformative context that shapes transformative learning (Taylor, 2017).

And, more importantly, this article expects, as Geofroy et al. (2019) also indicate, that teachers need to understand themselves as emancipatory agents, take responsibility for their individual growth because after all they have understandings of their subject-discipline and with their transformative pedagogical practice they have potentialities for exploring emancipatory possibilities in education. Besides, this research concludes that occurrences of holistic orientations and transformative learning in education have been sustained by educators of multiple disciplines even without recognizing or naming their pedagogical practices as transformative. Hence, as future inquiry for exploring other possibilities, this research has flashed out collaborative research between those educators/researchers deliberately fostering transformative learning and those educators informally sustaining, questioning and exploring a shift in perspectives regarding their pedagogical practices.

Funding

Researcher has not received any financial support for the research, and publication of this article.

List of References

- Belbase, S., Luitel, B., & Taylor, P. (2008). Autoethnography: A method of research and teaching for transformative education. *Journal of Education and Research*, 1(1), 86-95.
- Biesta, G. (2007). Why “what works” won’t work: Evidence-based practice and the democratic deficit in educational research. *Educational Theory*, 57(1), 1-22.
- Blalock, A. E., & Akehi, M. (2018). Collaborative autoethnography as a pathway for transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 16(2), 89-107.
- Blalock, A. E., & Akehi, M. (2018). Collaborative autoethnography as a pathway for transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 16(2), 89-107.

- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Brinegar, K., Harrison, L., & Hurd, E. (2018). Becoming transformative, equity-based educators. *Middle School Journal*, 49(5), 2-3
- Burns, H. (2011). Teaching for transformation:(Re) Designing sustainability courses based on ecological principles. *Journal of Sustainability Education*.
- Byrnes, K. (2012). A portrait of contemplative teaching: Embracing wholeness. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 10(1), 22-41.
- Charmaz, K., & Mitchell, R. G. (2001). Grounded theory in ethnography. *Handbook of Ethnography*, 160-174.
- Christiaens, G., Abegglen, J. A., & Gardner, A. (2010). Expert holistic nurses' advice to nursing students. *Journal of Holistic Nursing*, 28(3), 201-208
- Clark, J. (2005). *Scholarly writing: A personal odyssey* (Unpublished Doctoral dissertation). Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, ON.
- Conti, S. D. P. (2002). *The spiritual life of teachers: A study of holistic education and the holistic perspective* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Columbia, New York
- Craig, C. (2001). The relationships between and among teachers' narrative knowledge, communities of knowing, and school reform: A case of the "Monkey's Paw". *Curriculum Inquiry* 31(2), 303-331.
- Cranton, P. (2006). *Understanding and promoting transformative learning: A guide for educators of adults*. Jossey-Bass.
- Cranton, P., & Carusetta, E. (2004). Perspectives on authenticity in teaching. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 55(1), 5-22.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage.
- Dawson, P., Henderson, M., Mahoney, P., Phillips, M., Ryan, T., Boud, D., & Molloy, E. (2019). What makes for effective feedback: Staff and student perspectives. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 44(1), 25-36.
- Denzin, N.K. and Lincoln, Y.S. (2000). Introduction: The Discipline and practice of qualitative research. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (pp. 1 – 28). Sage.
- Dirkx, J. M. (2006). Engaging emotions in adult learning: A Jungian perspective on emotion and transformative learning. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2006(109), 15-26.
- Geofroy, S., Bitu, B., Barras, D., Lochan, S., McLeod, L., Stephens-James, L., & Valentine-Lewis, A. (2019). Emancipatory teaching practices in the understandings of Social Sciences teachers on a Diploma of Education programme. In *Teachers' Professional Development in Global Contexts* (pp. 179-198). Brill Sense.
- Greene, M. (1995). *Releasing the Imagination: Essays on Education, the Arts, and Social Change*. *The Jossey-Bass Education Series*. Jossey-Bass, Inc., Publishers, 350 Sansome Street.
- Harder, W., Robertson, P., and Maiden, E., (2019). *A holistic framework for transformational learning*. Darden Case No. UVA-OB-1281.
- Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (1998). *What's worth fighting for out there*. Teachers' College Press.
- Hart, T. (2014). *The integrative mind: Transformative education for a world on fire*. Rowman & Littlefield.

- Hernandez, K. A. C., Chang, H., & Ngunjiri, F. W. (2017). Collaborative autoethnography as multivocal, relational, and democratic research: Opportunities, challenges, and aspirations. *Auto/Biography Studies*, 32(2), 251-254.
- Illeris, K. (2014). Transformative learning and identity. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 12(2), 148-163.
- Kreber, C. (2004). An analysis of two models of reflection and their implications for educational development. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 9(1), 29-49.
- Krizek, R. L. (2003). Ethnography as the excavation of personal narrative. *Expressions of Ethnography: Novel Approaches to Qualitative Methods*, 45, 141-151.
- Lipson L. R., & Cranton, P. (2009). What you see depends upon how you look: A photographic journey of transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 7(4), 312-331.
- Luitel, B. C., & Wagley, S. (2017). Transformative educational research: Fleshing out the concepts. *Journal of Education and Research*, 7(1), 1-10.
- Merriam, S. B., & Simpson, E. L. (2000). *A guide to research for educators and trainers of adults*. Krieger.
- Mezirow, J. & Taylor, E. (2006). Teaching for change: Fostering transformative learning in the classroom. *New directions in adult and continuing education*. Jossey-Bass.
- Mezirow, J. (2003). Transformative learning as discourse. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 1(1), 58-63
- Mezirow, J. (2009). Transformative learning theory. In J. Mezirow, & E. W. Taylor (Eds.), *Transformative learning in practice: Insights from community*. Sage.
- Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*. Jossey-Bass.
- Miller, J. P. (2005). Introduction: Holistic learning. *Holistic Learning and Spirituality in Education*, 1-6.
- Miller, J. P. (2007). *The holistic curriculum*. University of Toronto press.
- Miller, R. (2000). Beyond reductionism: The emerging holistic paradigm in education. *The Humanistic Psychologist*, 28(1-3), 382-393.
- Morrison, K. A. (2008). Democratic classrooms: Promises and challenges of student voice and choice, part one. *Educational Horizons*, 50-60.
- Noddings, N. (2002). *Educating moral people: A caring alternative to character education*. Teachers College Press.
- Nye, A., & Clark, J. (2016). "Being and becoming" a researcher: Building a reflective environment to create a transformative learning experience for undergraduate students. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 14(4), 377-391.
- Owings, W. A., Kaplan, L. S., & Chappell, S. (2011). Troops to teachers as school administrators: A national study of principal quality. *NASSP Bulletin*, 95(3), 212-236.
- Palmer, P. (2007). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Palmer, P. J. (1999). Evoking the spirit in public education. *Educational Leadership*, 56, 6-11.
- Palmer, P. J. (2003). Teaching with heart and soul: Reflections on spirituality in teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 54(5), 376-385.
- Palmer, P. J. (2009). *A hidden wholeness: The journey toward an undivided life*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Palmer, P. J., Zajonc, A., & Scribner, M. (2010). *The heart of higher education: A call renewal*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc.

- Pandey, K. (2019). Experiencing transformative learning: An autoethnographic journey through ethical dilemma story pedagogy. *Bodhi: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 7, 227-244.
- Pasa, R. (2019). My journey from a waiter to a lecturer: An autoethnography. *NUTA Journal*, 6(1-2), 47-56
- Qutoshi, S. (2015). Auto/ethnography: A transformative research paradigm. *Dhaulagiri Journal of Sociology and Anthropology*, 9, 161-190.
- Qutoshi, S. (2018). Critical reflective practice as an approach to developing transformative living-theory. *Dhaulagiri Journal of Sociology and Anthropology*, 12, 107-111.
- Richardson, L., & St Pierre, E. (2008). A method of inquiry. *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*, 3(4), 473.
- Schreiner, P. (2010, September). The spiritual dimension in holistic education. In *Conference in memory of Dr. PilleValk Tartu/Estonia* (Vol. 10, No. 11).
- Slavick, G. & Zimbardo, P. (2012). Transformational teaching: The theoretical underpinnings, basic principles, and core methods. *Educational Psychology Review*, 24(4), 569-608.
- Taylor, E. W. (2007). An update of transformative learning theory: A critical review of the empirical research (1999–2005). *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 26(2), 173–1
- Taylor, E. W. (2017). Transformative learning theory. In A. Laros, T. Fuhr, T., & E.W. Taylor, (EDS.). *Transformative learning meets bildung* (pp. 17-29). Brill Sense.
- Taylor, E. W. (Ed.). (2006). The challenge of teaching for change. In E. W. Taylor (Ed.), *Teaching for change: Fostering transformative learning in the classroom* (New directions in adult and continuing education. No. 109, pp. 91–95). Jossey-Bass.
- Taylor, E. W., & Snyder, M. J. (2012). A critical review of research on transformative learning theory, 2006-2010. *The handbook of transformative learning: Theory, research, and practice* (pp. 37-55). Brill Sense.
- Taylor, E. W., & Cranton, P. (2013). A theory in progress? Issues in transformative learning theory. *European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*, 4(1), 33–47
- Witherell, C., & Nodding, M. (2002). *Stories lives tell: Narrative and dialogue in education*. Teachers College Press.
- Yacek, D. W. (2020). Should education be transformative? *Journal of Moral Education*, 49(2), 257-274.

Suggested Citation:

Ojha, G. (2020). Holistic orientation in education: Transformative art of including, connecting and balancing. *Journal of Transformative Praxis*, 1(1), 36-49.