Sunil Sigdel, *Decoratively Tightened for Last 200 Years.*
Gorkha Soldiers and Ex-rebels in Paintings: a Study of the Aesthetics of Human Agency

Bishwo Raj Parajuli

Abstract

When the socio-economic forces (basically those serving the capitalist mode of production) rule human beings, common people lose their agency, or the people in the upper strata tend to overlook, suppress and even suspend the agencies of people at the bottom level. We have evidences of the mockery of the writers and composers towards the soldiers and rebels deprived of their agencies. On the other hand, the aesthetics of human agency in subjugated people like soldiers and rebels is a relevant area of study. How do the contemporary Nepali paintings depict such theme is still a researchable gap. This paper investigates how contemporary paintings by some Nepali artists deal with the suspension of agency, subaltern consciousness and dissolution of humanity with regards to the lives of rebels (the ex-fighters of Maoist Peoples War in Nepal) and soldiers (British Gorkha soldiers). The discussion predominantly builds on the paintings ‘Gurkhas: Decoratively Tightened for Last 200 Years’ and ‘Bravery in the Box’ by Sunil Sigdel followed by ‘A Rebel Turned Gulf Migrant’ by Hitman Gurung, though not limited to these works. The discussion largely incorporates theoretical and conceptual implements from relevant literature on agency theories, resistance and body aesthetics, such as the ideas of Michael Garnett, Kasper Masse, Margaret S. Archer and others. The method of discussion is predominantly critical analysis of the selected paintings, personal interviews with the artists, and socio-political reverberations these works have created as reflected in some secondary texts like show feedback in visitor’s book, reviews in published in media, preface articles in exhibition brochures, etc. The findings of the discussion suggest absence and inhuman suspension of agencies in Gorkha Soldiers and Ex-Rebels. The paper concludes affirming the scope and nature of the aesthetics of human agency, especially focusing on the practice of deep agency.

Keywords: subjugated bodies, agency, representation, Gorkha soldiers, ex-rebels, contemporary Nepali paintings
Introduction

The paper examines selected paintings by contemporary Nepali painters, predominantly, Sunil Sigdel and Hitman Gurung, focusing on the aesthetics of human agency and body representation of British Gorkha soldiers and former rebels of Maoist Insurgency in Nepal. Originally, Gorkha was the capital of a small kingdom ruled by an ambitious and powerful Shah king Prithvi Narayan Shah during mid-18th century. The warrior force founded by the king got its name Gorkha soldiers. After a series of boundary disputes and repeated raids by Gorkha soldiers into Indo British territory (then), the Governor General of British India declared war on Nepal in 1814. After two long and bloody wars, a Peace Treaty was signed at Sugauli in 1816, which is commonly known as ‘Sugauli Treaty’. Then after, as per a key provision in the treaty, the British empire started recruiting the most robust boys especially from ethnic communities of the hills into their regiments so that the ever ready to die Gorkha soldiers would relentlessly guard the flagship of their colonial power. Similarly, the next subject ‘Maoist Rebels’ were the guerrilla fighters who fought in the Maoist Insurgency in Nepal between 1996 to 2006. The government and the insurgents brought the war to an end with the key agreement in The Comprehensive Peace Accord of November 21, 2006 about integrating the former combatants in the national force. However, the integration process was not easy. Thousands of disqualified former combatants remained either unemployed or were compelled to work as unskilled migrant workers in the Middle East and South East Asian countries. Stories and reports of their miserable lives in the foreign land have become familiar topics in media, literature and arts. In this light, studies on the agency and representation of the combatant forces like soldiers (that too, fighting for the other country) and rebels in visual arts of painting is comparatively a novel area of research in our context. The philosophical premise of this study is gradual dissolution of humanity in all walks of lives, consequent suspension of human agency and exploring the aesthetics of human agency at larger level. For specifying the research objectives, following research questions guide the study: How do contemporary Nepali paintings (by the selected artists) reveal the agency status of soldiers and ex-rebels, their voices of resistance against the suppression of the marginalized or subalterns, denial of justice, and impartial treatment to them. Some associated questions complement the research question in course of the discussion. For instance: What types of narratives or descriptions on suppressions and suspensions of agency do the selected artworks reveal? Do such reflections end with successful transactions with the viewers? How do the artists and audience perceive the forces of resistance in the artworks? To carry out the discussion on these problems, some relevant theoretical outlooks on body representation, suspension of agency and resisting voices of the victims have been considered as major tropes of argumentation.
The aesthetics of human agency in visual arts and literature

The biggest irony today is that humankind has come so far from barbaric state but unfortunately staking all the achievements of human civilizations. It took human beings thousands of years to be civilized; but it doesn’t even take fractions of a second to be uncivilized. Human beings have lost humanity in the sense that they have lost their agency by succumbing to machines, artificial intelligence, prosthetic forces and dismantling all the cultural assets and social institutions existing through thousands of years. There is a big question mark on the advancement of human science itself. Levi Strauss is skeptical about the so called progress of human science as he believes that the ultimate goal of human science is not to constitute but to dissolve man (qtd. in Archer, Margaret 18). Similarly, post-modernist thinkers like Lyotard, Foucault, Gergen, Baudrillard, Rorty, among others also express their pessimism about the scope of humanity. Foucault relates the history of mankind with the history of power. The issues of agency and resistance are relevant as long as power dynamics drive human societies. If we review the history of dissolution of human agency in the west, we unfold that whenever the social force dominated human beings, their agency was at stake. For Foucault, subversion of human agency through power reacts like spring pushes up or boomerangs back to the power block (Archer, 19). Michael Garnett proposes that agency is the capacity of an actor to act in a given environment independently (3). If we talk about human agency in general (instead of agency of an individual), it should be the outcome of collective historical dynamics rather than individual behaviors. For example, on the basis of historical dynamics of Rana Regime in Nepal, one can easily assert that Nepalese were deprived of basic agencies as human beings such as freedom to live, fundamental rights of education, and articulation of free opinions in those days. Exploration of the aesthetics of human agency in Nepali arts and literature is a lucrative area of study.

Though visual art of paintings in Nepal is still unexplored in terms of such modernist paradigms, some Nepali literary texts and movies deal with the themes of such deprivation of agencies. We can revisit a few examples: Bhupi Sherchan was perhaps the most agnostic Nepali writer, poet who expressed resentments and reservations towards Gorkha recruitments system through his poems. His poem “Ghantaghar (The Clock Tower)” is a mockery against the idle life of retired soldiers who fought in wars and won medals for their bravery. He makes an analogy of an aged retired soldier with the historical clock tower built by Chandra Shamsher. Both the soldier and the clock tower represent past glory with redundant present. Similarly, in the poem “Haami (We)” from his acclaimed anthology “Ghumne Mech Maathi Andho Manchhe (A Blind Man on a Revolving Chair),” he mocks the so called bravery of the Gorkhas. He relates their bravery with their naivety or foolishness: “Hami bir chhaun tara
buddu chhaun, hami buddu chhaun ra ta bir chhaun...,” literally translated as “We are brave but we are fools; we are fools, that’s why we are brave” (Sherchan, Hami, 15). This statement raises a serious question on the so-called bravery and practice of agency in soldiers.

Another story “Ek Raat (A Night)” by BP Koirala (from his fiction collection Swetbhairavi) sets an example of undying revolutionary consciousness of a freedom fighter. Kishor, the protagonist of the story, when asked for his final wish before his execution (alleged for bombing at the rulers) fearlessly expresses his wish for freedom, dignity as human beings and well beings of all the citizens. His demand is for nothing but human agency in true sense (Koirala, 28-38).

Similarly, Nepali fictions including “Chhapamaar ko Chhoro” by Mahesh Bikram Shah, and recent movies like “Dokh” by Anup Baral and “Paniphoto” by Khagendra Lamichhane also appropriate the stories and contexts from the Maoist insurgency and post insurgency period, and uncover the desolate lives of the rebels, especially the disowned and MIW (Missing in War) ones. These are just some of the representative pieces of Nepali literature and visual arts that deal with the life and lost agency of the soldiers and rebels. A considerable research gap exists with regards to such themes in visual texts like contemporary paintings. So, how the soldiers and rebels have been represented in paintings is an intriguing question. In this light, this brief study deals with the aesthetics of human agency and representational issues of the bodies of soldiers and rebels.

These representative examples establish how soldiers, fighters and rebels are subjugated as instruments and scapegoats of power blocks. Their agency is always questionable; therefore always at stake. Moreover, real agency is fuzzy concept. We cannot literally assert how much agency we possess or practice. Therefore, Garnett moves further and unfolds inner freedom or deep agency as real agency of human beings. Inner freedom or deep agencies are almost utopian as three powerful constraints come as impediment to attain them: i. inner constraints (voluntary decisions like to act or not to act. ii. Lack of self-governance (cases of addictions and habits) iii. Not being independent from internal and external controls (such as temptation and provocation). So the desire to agency is always an ontological problematic. Quest for pure, free, uncompromised agency is a myth. In the light of this lack, Garnett makes a proposition with some pragmatics for agency practice: Either we tilt towards the theory of governance by developing opportunities for self-governance and independence or we assert our agencies identifications and authority through our writings or creations. In this paper, I explore how the painters practice the second option of agency.

Methodology

Primarily, this study is a qualitative analysis of the selected paintings by artists Sunil Sigdel and Hitman Grung focusing on the discourse of agency.
and body representation of soldiers and former rebels. However, the study also refers to other works of similar or related themes. The reason behind choosing these painters is that they display contemporary awareness towards the most burning social, cultural and political issues of our time. Especially, the issues of body representation of the subaltern people are their preferred subject matter. Besides, both have showcased their works frequently and received critical response from viewers. This researcher observed their exhibition thoroughly and even had personal interviews with them. The sub-headings of the discussion part are the thematic arrangements of detail critical analysis of the artworks. Besides clinical observation and journals writing on the paintings, the personal interviews with the artists, viewers feedback in the visitors’ book, reviews and writings published in various media including newspaper, online portals, concerned websites, preface articles of the exhibition catalogue and brochure, etc. work as basic data feeders for the discussion. Thematically entitled discussion strands below are in conversation with our research questions.

**Results and discussion**

The following discussion and summary of the results is based on intensive study and analysis respectively on the paintings ‘Gurkhas: Decoratively Tightened for Last 200 Years’ and ‘Bravery in the Box’ by Sunil Sigdel, and ‘A Rebel turned Gulf Migrant’ by Hitman Gurung and the archived story of its making:

**Study 1: Gorkha Soldiers by Sunil Sigdel**

Born and brought up in Pokhara, also known as ‘The City of Lahures’, and the city locating a large recruitment camp for British Gorkha soldiers, Sunil was always agnostic about the tradition of Gorkha soldiers recruitment in hilly areas. As an artist, his major concern was their agency in surviving as independent human beings. However, this study does not aim to judge the tradition of British Gorkha recruitment system, which is still going on. In 2017, Sunil was on a sponsored residency tour to Scotland. There he saw a pamphlet showcasing a photograph of two retired and aged Gorkha soldiers that exposed miserable lives of the soldiers back in Nepal. The pamphlet also had an appeal to the public for a few Pounds donation in order to help the duo soldiers. Such use of the pitiable and shabby body image of the Gorkha soldiers by the British people really touched Sunil not only as an independent artist but also as a sovereign Nepali. Those were the same soldiers who fought for the British regime during the major wars shedding their blood, sweat and tears in alien lands. He made a series of paintings on this theme. Among them, this study discusses two acclaimed works by Sigdel.

The selected painting ‘Gurkha: Decoratively Tightened for Last Two Hundred Years’ is a major creation of the series. The painting comprises of four square divisions showing the agitated facial expressions of the soldiers with a palimpsest background of Queen Elizabeth. The background, painted as
the palimpsest of motifs and images in paper currencies, is meaningful as money comes as prime source of motivation behind the bravery of soldiers. All four quarters of the frame have a number of verisimilitudes. The four distinct facial expressions in the painting articulate anger and vigor of the soldiers as a whole. A question arises: Why four if they are same? Sunil makes a point that a single motif would not be sufficient enough to justify his theme in cogent way (Interview with the artist). For reflecting the expression of bravery, the painter skillfully reflects *veera rasa* in all faces. However, the backdrop, historical facts, contextual events and stories together indicate that Gorkha’s bravery is a so-called bravery; gallantry without agency.

The next painting is an acclaimed work by Sigdel that won him Sovereign Asian Art Prize Final Nominee in 2012-13.

“Nepal has no conflict with any nation in the world. It is tragic, therefore, that thousands of Gurkha lives have been lost in the two world wars… and are still perishing in distant wars (Artist’s words, Webpage).” In this remark, besides the ones who were killed in the wars, the painter expresses concern over the desolate lives of retired British Gorkha soldiers far in their homeland. Similarly, Tayeba Begum Lippi, painter and visual artist, commenting on Sunil’s painting unfolds a fact that the community of British Gorkha soldiers hasn’t had intimate relations with the British Force. The root cause, as she indicates, goes back the past i.e. Sugauli Treaty of 1816 A.D. (Lipi’s Audio Commentary on YouTube, Ex-Servicemen’s Organization) reveals that the Gurkhas are living with an agony within the stories of their gallantry: “Our families, societies and nation as a whole have lost their vigour, self-esteem and pride. The pain is deeply hidden but real; consequent poverty envelops us. (GAESO, 4)”. In this light, absence of agency in the case of British Gorkhas means living as puppet soldiers of British imperialism or being killing machines. After all, soldiers are instruments of the rulers to defeat or kill the soldiers or fighters of their enemies. Ironically, whoever gets killed in the war is a victim without agency of living because soldiers of either party are innocent. In most of the wars, mastermind of the war hardly gets killed or gets killed at the dead end only.

A memorandum submitted to the parliamentary committee of the British government by GAESO (Gurkha Army
These opinions matter on the ground that most of the Nepali people still assert that the treaty was a losing deal for Nepal.

The title, the contents and the collage technique suggest that the painter is empathetic as well as sarcastic towards the history and present lives of British Gorkha soldiers. On one hand, the facts and stories about gallantry and sacrifice of British Gorkha soldiers in the wars and their contribution for keeping peace during different events of global unrest have been glorious history for British Gorkha community as well as the British government. On the other hand, the desolate lives and overlooked misery of the retired soldiers and unfair treatment towards the working soldiers in terms of discriminatory payments and benefits establish that the soldiers have been used as mere instruments or scapegoats for sustaining post war imperial power of Britain and its allies. In an official memorandum submitted to the parliamentary committee of British government in 2014, GAESO claims that the Tri-partite Agreement between British government, British India Authority and Nepal government on Gurkha recruitment provision was declared illegal by British Royal Court. The memorandum questions the recruitment tradition taken for granted so far:  “How can Britain recruit the Gurkhas as the citizen of another
sovereign country, while Nepal never became a British colony or party to any wars? Under which particular norm of international jurisprudence, Gurkhas were forced to serve in the British Army for the last two hundred years? (GAESO, 10)” Such tussle between the British government and the pressure groups of Ex-British Gorkha community is still going on.

The collage painting in mixed media comprises of well juxtaposed visual clues like pictorial allusions of realistic photographs of the agile retired soldiers as well as archives of ‘brave alive soldiers’, illustrations of the warriors in the trench, and scattered parts of the plane tail in the upper and lower covering of the box, etc. These motifs and signs all imply a troubling, insecure message for the receiver of the box. The dismantled parcel, dispatched to Nepal by the British government, has reached to the concerned family with nothing substantial within but stories of their braveries. Thus, the dismantled parcel conveys an unpleasant message for the British Gorkha Community and Nepali people as a whole. The bravery of Gorkhas is just a tag for making them fight as instruments for the imperial power. It's a false consciousness; a consciousness without agency. After all, soldiers are such subjugated bodies of human beings, who can't live for themselves. They are bereft of agency of their bodies. A soldier's being is conditioned by various power cords like chain of command, state enforcement, self-disciplines, code of conduct, vows of sacrifices, circumstances and more. In short, a soldier's body (even that of a rebel) is a sacrificing body.

Based on the issues of war ethics, violation of human rights, and conditioning for voluntary sacrifice, artworks and literature represent British Gorkha soldiers as victims of institutionalized discrimination too. For decades, the British Gorkha soldiers have been struggling for the equal rights and comparative benefits their equivalent native British soldiers are receiving. Promises are made repeatedly but equality is still a far cry for them. In 2014, GAESO raised some serious questions on the legal status of British Gorkha recruitment (running as a legacy of British empire for more than two hundred years), constitutional ownership of the British government with regards to the recruitment, and most importantly the abuse of human rights, exploitation of the soldiers (for both working and retired soldiers) in terms of service benefits, post-retirement benefits and rights of settlement, and the miserable living conditions of the war veterans back in Nepal. Their main petition in the conclusion of the memorandum (submitted to the British parliamentary committee in 2014) itself articulates the whole story and justifies why the works like Decoratively Tightened for Two Hundred Years and Bravery in the Box are relevant:

What benefits Nepal received while fighting wars for Britain for last two hundred years against other sovereign countries? What benefits the ethnic communities and their British Gurkha
Soldiers gained for fighting for Britain, losing more than 60k lives, missing their own culture and tradition? Both the governments need to answer the world communities and nearly 30 million Nepali people. (GAESO, 11)

Concrete answers to these pertinent questions will ensure their agency if not as soldiers, at least as free human being of a sovereign country. Honest and admissible answers to these questions can console the receivers of the bravery boxes or coffin boxes.

**Study 2: Ex-rebels Turned Gulf Migrants by Hitman Gurung**

...a person had joined the People’s Liberation Army with dreams and hopes that the revolution would bring change to problematic social, cultural and economic systems. This sky – these houses made of mud, stone, wood, orange and white clay–are all still the same...Only that person is missing. And his dreams have disappeared along with his sweat in the heat of the deserts …

(Quoted from the Facebook wall of the artist)

This anecdote based on the painting “A Rebel Turned a Gulf Migrant” is a tell-tale evidence of how lives and dream of former rebels, who fought for the sake of liberation and overall upliftment of downtrodden people (as claimed by the leaders of the war), have been shattered in the post war realities. Most of the former rebels (particularly those disowned by the concerned party and later categorized as unfit for integrating with the mainstream national army) are living in pathetic conditions. Their settlement and management by the government could be a prospective topic for field research. This study, however, is limited to the problem of how the painting represents the body or being of the ex-rebels and soldiers.

Hitman Gurung creates visual discourse on common Nepali people, especially former rebels turned labors and unemployed people who are compelled to go to foreign land (trend wise Gulf countries) as unskilled or forced labors for their livelihood. Otherwise they just stay idle at home and remain either unemployed or partially employed. As the employment opportunities are scant in Nepal, they are forced to work in the hazardous sites of Gulf countries under extremely demanding working conditions and high temperature. Their safety and work benefits are mostly underprivileged.

As reported by the migrant workers in the Middle East, there is an inhuman system of labor sub-contract called ‘Kafala’. Kafala is a nexus of sub-contractors or labor supplying agents who also manage labor camps. Kafalas confiscate the passport and important documents until the migrant workers agree to work under their imposed working conditions and periods. The migrant workers are kept like hostages. They are blocked to go out to the bar, club or the place for social gathering. In many cases, the employers and Kafalas cheat the labors in paying their promised salaries and wages. They have to work for sub-minimum wages under extreme working conditions (Based on interviews...
with migrant workers in the Middle East countries).

Moreover, their anguish of being displaced from homeland and exponentially increasing cases of familial integrations and disasters are other serious problems. All in all, Hitman depicts the existing social, political and emotional impacts of low income labor migration in his artworks.

This huge canvas is full of meta-narratives on the rebel who turned a migrant worker in gulf countries. The focal figure in the painting is a single person living two phases of life: First, as a former rebel from the period of Maoist insurgency in Nepal. Second, as a forced migrant worker in the Middle-East countries. It works like a fractal image with double stories. There are a number of indicators that represent the figure on the right as a former rebel-camouflaged combat dress, gun, the starred scarf tied around his forehead, Gold star shoes etc. On the other hand, the figure on the left looks identical as migrant worker because of his yellow crash helmet, Arabian scarf, overalls, and the fluorescent jacket he is wearing. These visual clues signify at various layers. At first glance, they work in the image-making of a rebel. To a great
extent, it also helps us in making visual analogies of rebels with well-equipped soldiers of an army. Both the figures represent stereotypical bodies of common people like rebels and labors. As rebel turned redundant fighters and in course of time turned into forced migrant workers, their stories are the stories of subaltern people. Their destiny is to become an instrument of change. In first case, the politicians and the commanders use them as fighting and killing machines. In second case, the labor trafficking agents, suppliers and Kaffala use them as instrument of money making.

Recent reports of the alarming casualties and death tolls of Nepali migrant workers in Qatar, who lost their lives and physical abilities while working in the constructions sites of more than eight colossal stadiums for 2022 Qatar World Cup, are examples of exploitation and dehumanization of labors by rich people and countries. The Guardian reveals more than 6,500 migrant workers from India, Pakistan, Nepal, Bangladesh, and Sri Lanka have died in Qatar since it won the right to host the World Cup ten years ago. Nepal’s death toll alone occupies the second highest with 1,641 (The Guardian, 2021). According to the reports, workers die natural death because of physiological failure of heart or respiratory system. Sometime they die in workplace accidents. Some of them even commit suicides too. But their post-mortem reports hardly explore the actual problems of behind their deaths. Actually they die of drudgery, feeling of homesickness, alienation, depression, family disintegration and a multiple of reasons. The issue of suspension of human agency comes as a core issue in such cases.

Gurung creates an interesting visual narrative of migrant workers by archiving them in various frames. In the four frames presented here (though the actual project features a number of villagers who are on the verge of being forced migrant workers as most of them are unskilled), four representative characters pose for photo with the central character i.e. the rebel turned Gulf migrant, respectively, a Gurung fellow in typical Gurung attire with typical stony houses in the backdrop; the migrant and a villager along with a stony village trail in the background; the migrant and a farmer with a buffalo shed in the background; and finally, the migrant and a student with a school building in the background. The archiving comes as a powerful visual rhetoric here. Four different settings and characters posing with the recurring character of migrant worker create a unity in the photograph. Individuals might be different but all of them tell the similar story of migration. The painter uses his own body image for the embodiment of migrating people. He portrays himself as the representative migrant or speaker of the stories of all migrant workers.

Conclusion

The discussion so far brings us to some conclusions. In the first painting, we focus the issues of exploitation and instrumentation of British Gorkha soldiers. The painter sarcastically depicts
that the so-called bravery of the soldiers gets dispatched as a parcel-box to homeland. Though most of the Gorkhas have permanently settled in the UK since 2009 as per the provision of the retirement benefit entitled to them, this provision covers only those who retired after 1 July 1997. It excludes those war veterans and heroes who actually fought in the wars and achieved glorious victory for England. As the title of the painting suggests, it’s their fading glory in the box that is being dispatched to Nepal, not their current living status. On the other hand, as discussed in the case of ‘Rebel Turned Gulf Migrant’ the ex-rebels are compelled to go to foreign land for livelihood and ironically return back in coffin boxes. These instances guide to a common agenda – the agenda of living with or without agency and being a free individual. For decades, the Gorkha soldiers have been fighting against the inequality and injustice of British government through their pressure groups like Gorkha Army Ex-Servicemen’s Organization (GAESO). Still there are considerable discrepancies and disparities between the Anglo British soldiers and British Gorkha soldiers. More than material benefits of the soldiers, at deeper level, aim of the painter seems to bring out the absence of human agency in being a soldier or rebel.
A soldier or a rebel, whether on the job or retired is not an autonomous human being who can practice human agencies at various strengths and embodiment of self in true sense. In the least, they can live independently after their retirement and be who they want to be. However, as Bhupi Sherchan satirizes, the bygones in their lives still haunt them and they brood alone like redundant clock towers. They can still create opportunities for self-governance and independence and assert agencies via identifications and authority of their being. In case of ex-rebels, all stakeholders of the state, civilians and ex-rebels themselves should push their boundaries and assert their agencies. We can bring in examples of some ex-rebels around us who have created space and agency of their own due to their innovative idea and its implication, their trust and perseverance in independent lifestyle like self-employment, life skill enhancement, educational enhancement and so on. Some of them are even practicing deep agency overcoming all kinds of internal as well as external constraints. Though materializing deep agency in one’s life is a myth, actualization of inner freedom and skills of self-governance bring them closer to deep agency.

References


Sherchan, Bhupi. 2069 B.S.. “Hami (We)” Ghumne Mech Maathi Andho Maanchhe. Saajha Prakashan,

Sigdel, Sunil. Painting Images of “Gurkha: Decoratively Tightened from Last 200 years” http://sigdelsunil.blogspot.com


